

**TOWN OF CORNWALL
SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING
Wednesday, July 6, 2022, 4:30 P.M.
AGENDA**

- 1) **Call to Order**
- 2) **Land Acknowledgement**
- 3) **Approval of Agenda/Additions to the Agenda**
- 4) **Disclosure of Conflict of Interest**
- 5) **Finance/Administration**
 - a) **Resolution – Sidewalk Snow Removal Equipment**
 - b) **Resolution – Award Tender – Main Street Water Main and AT Trails**
- 6) **Adjournment**



**TOWN OF CORNWALL
RESOLUTION**

DATE: July 6, 2022

DEPARTMENT: Finance/Administration

MOTION NUMBER: F/A-31-2022 Tender for Sidewalk/Trail Snow Removal Equipment

MOTION CARRIED _____

MOTION LOST _____

MOTION WITHDRAWN _____

Moved by Councillor _____

Cory Stevenson

Seconded by Councillor _____

Judy Herlihy

Whereas: The Town of Cornwall has over the last several years issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) for sidewalk and trail snow clearing for three year terms and employed contractors to carry out these duties;

And Whereas: In response to the 2019/20 – 2021/22 RFP for these services only one bid was received, which bid was accepted, and the Town has again issued an RFP for the provision of these services in the spring of 2022 and there were no bids received;

And Whereas: The Town is not currently prepared to provide sidewalk and trail snow clearing services in house and now finds it necessary to take on these tasks with town equipment and staff;

Therefore, be it Resolved: That the Town issue an RFP for the purchase of snow removal equipment sufficient to carry out the required snow clearing tasks, per the document considered at the Committee of Council meeting held June 22, 2022, and attached to this resolution;

And be it Further Resolved: The results of this RFP be brought back to Council for further consideration and award.



COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL

Date: June 22, 2022

TO: Mayor McCourt and Members of Cornwall Town Council
SUBMITTED BY: Doug Longmore, Manager of Infrastructure and Shelley Rector, DCAO/Manager Corporate Services
DATE: June 22, 2022
SUBJECT: Sidewalk Snow Clearing Information

ORIGIN: This subject was discussed during budget deliberations, and it was decided to put out an RFP to see who would put in a proposal for sidewalk snow removal. An analysis was provided at the time of the pros and cons of hiring an external contractor vs having the work completed in house.

BACKGROUND:

Town of Cornwall is expanding its active transportations trail system and sidewalks. Sidewalks and paved trails are expected to be accessible for use year-round and cleared within a reasonable time after a snow/ice event.

An RFP was posted on May 20 and closed June 3, 2022. No submissions were received. During the last call for proposals (2019-2022), Griffin's Service Centre was the only proposal received. Griffins also had the contract from 2016 to 2019.

2018-2019 Actual cost \$72,134.14 (approximately 564 hours)
2019-2020 Actual cost \$70,936.41 (approximately 555 hours)
2020-2021 Actual cost \$81,180.99 (approximately 635 hours)
2021-2022 Actual cost \$110,867.19
2022-2023 Budget: \$86,512.93

In addition, the first three years shown were years of lower snow fall. As can be seen from the cost for last fiscal, the higher the snow fall the higher the cost to the Town. Years like 2013/14 and 2014/15 would have extraordinary costs if done by an external provider with current pricing.

DISCUSSION:

There were no responses to our RFP that was posted. This means we either would have to repost the same RFP which may still result in no responses or explore the option of doing the work in-house.

We note that previously there were concerns with the machinery used by the contractor and with our ability to control service levels. For example, the last few winters have had minimal snow but high levels of freezing rain. The machinery used by the contractor is a shaker. The shaker can only use salt and it needs to get filled up frequently. This means it takes longer to do the clean up when hiring a contractor. In addition, the salt does not leave grit to allow people to have something to grip onto when walking.

Using the in-house option would allow our staff to supplement the clean up by going around with sand to provide something for gripping.

We have also had some staffing challenges in the Parks and Recreation maintenance area. Including some challenges in obtaining numbers and/or qualified candidates for the last few competitions that have been posted. For analysis purposes, we have used a higher per hour salary to ensure we can find people to do the work. Having this work done in-house would ensure we can offer year-round work to staff who can help with the maintenance in the Parks and Recreation Department in the summer and work at snow removal in the winter as well as help with rink maintenance.

A newer machine could allow for a salt/sand combination to spread on the sidewalk in one trip. This would mean staff will have minimal return trips for salting/sanding sidewalks and we believe it will provide better service standards. In addition, a new machine could be used for grooming non-paved winter trails among other tasks if additional attachments are purchased.

As previously discussed, the following are the benefits/drawbacks of doing the work internally:

Pros

- a. Providing year-round employment for two staff members (seasonal P and R could be FT). In addition, it provides staff to help with P and R maintenance and there are other PW staff who can help out if someone calls in sick.
- b. Better value for money per the Financial Analysis below. Note: It is anticipated that as the sidewalks and trails grow, there would be a point where an additional seasonal staff might be required. This analysis included funding for that second staff as well as for an additional machine which leaves a positive variance of approximately \$12,400 (20-year machine amortization) or approximately \$6,400 (15-year amortization) compared with 2021-22 contracting costs which more than covers any contingency costs that might arise.
- c. The Town has control over the work being done.
- d. Increased flexibility to respond to public complaints.
- e. Town can ensure standards of clearing are met.
- f. Costs will be maintained regardless of the level of snow during the year.
- g. Flexible work hours – can have the staff member out early in the am to have the clearing done.
- h. With additional attachments, can use the machinery for winter trail grooming and potentially for other work as we obtain additional attachments.
- i. Increase service standards in a more efficient delivery.
- j. Allows for succession planning.

Cons

- a. Not providing work for a local contractor.
- b. Need to invest in owning and maintaining equipment.



COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL
Date: June 22, 2022

FINANCIAL ANALYSIS:

For fiscal 2021-22 the total cost was \$110,867.19 for the contractor to provide the service. We have reviewed the cost of hiring a staff member including benefits and the cost of purchasing the machinery required and determined the total cost of providing the service in house with two staff and two machines would be \$104,440 which includes 1,000 hours for 2 people at \$22 per hour plus benefits like three weeks vacation and RRSP. This is higher than previously discussed as we would want to utilize seasonal Parks and Rec staff in these positions, so they have full-time year-round work. Compared to the current year, there are still significant savings. In addition, the staff member who is doing the snow clearing would be available to assist with rink maintenance when not doing the snow clearing which would decrease the need for an additional rink maintenance staff.

The analysis below provides the costing based on a 15-year useful life and a 20 year useful life. If we look at the analysis conservatively, we will say 15 years. However, we have two machines so it is possible that it will extend the useful life to 20 years which results in additional savings.

Town of Cornwall Sidewalk Clearing Cost of In House Option for Service Delivery With Two Staff			
Human Resource Cost - Annually		Equipment Cost Annually	
Salary and Benefits	48,840	Machine Cost	360,000
On Call	3,476	Anticipated Life	15
	52,316	Annual Cost	24,000
CP and EI Costs	5,232	Annual Interest If Borrowing	2,893
Total Salary Cost	57,548	Total Cost Capital (Annual)	26,893
Note Salary based on 1000 hours at \$22 per hour plus RRSP and 3 weeks vacation for 2 staff		Misc Other Costs	20,000
Total Cost of Providing the Service In House			104,440
Note: these estimates are conservative in nature and represent the highest potential cost			
No on call required for second staff; having two machines extends the useful life of each by five more years			

Snow removal for 2021-22	\$	110,867.19
Snow Removal Budget 2022-23	\$	86,512.93



COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL

Date: June 22, 2022

Town of Cornwall Sidewalk Clearing Cost of In House Option for Service Delivery With Two Staff			
Human Resource Cost - Annually		Equipment Cost Annually	
Salary and Benefits	48,840	Machine Cost	360,000
On Call	3,476	Anticipated Life	20
	52,316	Annual Cost	18,000
CP and EI Costs	5,232	Annual Interest If Borrowing	2,893
Total Salary Cost	57,548	Total Cost Capital (Annual)	20,893
Note Salary based on 1000 hours at \$22 per hour plus RRSP and 3 weeks vacation for 2 staff		Misc Other Costs	20,000
Total Cost of Providing the Service In House			98,440
Note: these estimates are conservative in nature and represent the highest potential cost			
No on call required for second staff; having two machines extends the useful life of each by five more years			

Snow removal for 2021-22	\$	110,867.19
Snow Removal Budget 2022-23	\$	86,512.93



TOWN OF CORNWALL
RESOLUTION

DATE: July 6, 2022

DEPARTMENT: Finance/Administration

MOTION NUMBER: F/A-32-2022 Tender Award Main Street Water Main Upsize and AT Trails

MOTION CARRIED _____

MOTION LOST _____

MOTION WITHDRAWN _____

Moved by Councillor _____ **Corey Frizzell**

Seconded by Councillor _____ **Cory Stevenson**

Whereas: The Town of Cornwall issued a tender for approximately 700 metres of new water main and the upsizing of approximately 1,400 metres of existing water main, running from the new wellfield west along Main Street to the town boundary and east along Main Street to the approximate location of the veterinary clinic;

And Whereas: The Town, for reasons of cost and efficiency, included in the water main tender, the construction of the remaining two phases of the Main Street Active Transportation Trail from the intersection of John Street and Main Street to the intersection of Terry Fox Way and Main Street;

And Whereas: Two bids were received in response to this tender call;

Therefore, be it Resolved: That the Town upon, and pursuant to, the recommendation of the Town's Engineers, award the contract for the Water Main Upgrade and Phases 3 and 4 of the Main Street Active Transportation Trail to Duffy Construction Ltd., the low bidder, in the amount of five million, eight hundred and forty eight thousand, three hundred and sixty five dollars and twenty five cents (\$5,848,365.25) inclusive of HST.



June 29, 2022

Town of Cornwall
P.O. Box 430
Cornwall, PE
COA 1H0

Subject: Cornwall Main Street Watermain Upsizing and AT Trail - Tender Recommendation

Dear Mr. Longmoore:

Tenders were received for the above project at 1:00 PM, Thursday, June 23, 2022, and have been reviewed and verified and are attached for your reference.

A summary of the tenders is as follows:

<u>Low Bidder</u>	<u>Bid Amount</u>	<u>Construction Duration</u>
Duffy Construction Ltd.	\$5,848,365.25	July 11/22 to June 30/23 = 30 Construction Weeks

Other Bidders

Island Coastal Services Ltd.	\$8,252,377.00 <i>*corrected from \$8,251,687.00</i>	Aug 01/22 to Sept 29/23 = 28 Construction Weeks
------------------------------	---	--

Please note that Island Coastal's tender submitted was missing the unit price breakdown for Part 3 which is the Active Transportation Trail Phase 4. With this said, Island Coastal did complete the Summary page which indicates their overall tender amount.

It is therefore recommended that, once the approval from Environment is received, the contract be awarded to the low bidder, Duffy Construction Ltd., in the amount of \$5,848,365.25, including HST, if the necessary funds are available.

Copies of the tender documents are enclosed for your records. Please contact me if there are any questions regarding the above.

Best regards,

Luc Van Hul, FEC, P.Eng.

LVH/gd

cc: Morley Foy, P.Eng. - Dept. of Environment, Energy and Climate Action
Kevin Coady - Town of Cornwall
Spencer Hay, P.Eng. - WSP

Encl.
WSP ref.: 211-14201-00

195 MacEwen Road
Summerside, PE
Canada C1N 5Y4

T: +1 902 436-2669
F: +1 902 436-8601
wsp.com